Trafficking, Trauma, and Trust: Re-empowering Betrayed and Blamed Survivors of Human Trafficking

Amb. Mark P. Lagon, Ph.D.
Georgetown University
Council on Foreign Relations

PLENARY ADDRESS ON NOVEMBER 17, 2013,
30TH ANNUAL CONFERENCE,
INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY FOR THE STUDY OF TRAUMA AND DISSOCIATION
Human Trafficking

- What it looks like and its scale
- Policy overview: progress tackling it
- Trauma: impact on survivors
- Addressing survivors’ needs
- The key: trust
EXAMPLES

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
EXAMPLES

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
- Adult sex trafficking
  - street, brothels, Internet-sold
EXAMPLES

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
- Adult sex trafficking
  - street, brothels, Internet-sold
- Worst forms of child labor
EXAMPLES

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
- Adult sex trafficking
  - street, brothels, Internet-sold
- Worst forms of child labor
- Labor for undocumented migrant workers
  - Apple pickers in Washington State
EXCEPTIONS

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
- Adult sex trafficking
  - street, brothels, Internet-sold
- Worst forms of child labor
- Labor for undocumented migrant workers
  - Apple pickers in Washington State
- Labor for documented migrants workers
  - Construction workers in the Persian Gulf
EXAMPLES

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
- Adult sex trafficking
  - street, brothels, Internet-sold
- Worst forms of child labor
- Labor for undocumented migrant workers
  - Apple pickers in Washington State
- Labor for documented migrants workers
  - Construction workers in the Persian Gulf
- Forced labor for people never crossing borders
  - Dalits in brick kilns, rice mills, and rug weaving in India
Examples

- Child sex trafficking (all prostitution of minors)
- Adult sex trafficking
  - street, brothels, Internet-sold
- Worst forms of child labor
- Labor for undocumented migrant workers
  - Apple pickers in Washington State
- Labor for documented migrants workers
  - Construction worker in the Persian Gulf
- Forced labor for people never crossing borders
  - Dalits in brick kilns, rice mills, and rug weaving in India
- Domestic servants (including of diplomats enjoying immunity)
“HUMAN TRAFFICKING”

What *is* it?
HUMAN TRAFFICKING’S ESSENCE

- Categories of people treated as less than human and lacking access to justice
  - Women, children, minorities
  - Documented and undocumented migrants

- **extreme** (not modest)

- **exploitation** (not movement)
  - Through violent force or psychological manipulation
  - For labor and sex
  - Children and adults
  - Across and within borders

⇒ The “human trade”...

Modern day slavery
WHAT HUMAN TRAFFICKING IS NOT

- Illegal immigration
- Only for sex
- Only victimizing minors
- Unrelated to the “customer” and demand
COMES FROM BOTH ECONOMICS (NEED/GREED) & POLITICS (WEAK RULE OF LAW)

GLOBALLY

- Aye Aye Win – Burmese forced labor victim in Thailand
COMES FROM BOTH ECONOMICS (NEED/GREED) & POLITICS (WEAK RULE OF LAW)

DOMESTICALLY

- Girl prostituted at truck stops in the Midwest
DEMAND FOR HUMAN TRAFFICKING FOR SEX

A young girl and her elderly “child sex tourist” client captured on film on the beach at Pattaya, Thailand. “Child sex tourism” draws men from wealthy countries to less developed countries where they take advantage of economically vulnerable women and children and weak criminal justice systems.

THE JOHNS
SEX FOR SALE AND THE MEN WHO BUY IT
VICTOR MALAREK
author of THE NATASHAS
DEMAND FOR HUMAN TRAFFICKING FOR THE CHEAPEST LABOR
THE RESULT OF THAT DEMAND

Department of Labor’s List

http://www.dol.gov/ilab/programs/ocft/2012TVPRA.pdf

Goods like:
- Rubber
- Pig iron → steel → cars
- Cocoa → Chocolate
- Tantalum → cell phones
IMAGES OF TRAFFICKING: DEHUMANIZATION

Kay Chernush

- Photographer for U.S. Department of State Trafficking in Persons Report
- Founder of ArtWorks for Freedom

Bought and Sold Exhibit images
Deeper In Debt

Back home there was no way to provide for my family. When sickness came I had to borrow money and sell my father’s land. I thought if I came here I could help them. But now I have only more debt. To renew my contract, I have to pay again $1800. Company is not supposed to take any renewal money, but they all do it. The boss man says if I don’t pay more he will send me to repatriation center. Very hard work...very much debt. So many stories like mine.

— Bangladeshi migrant laborer in Singapore.
“The agency said I will be babysitter in Germany. Good opportunity, this is my dream. So after five days on bus, they tell me no babysitting, go work in sex club. I was shocked. Too afraid to do anything. Later, when a client helps me escape to The Hague, I go. But that guy just sold me to another pimp. When I tell my story, people say, ‘Is there really trafficking here?’”

— Russian woman from Siberia, trafficked first to Germany, then to the Netherlands.
Day’s Work

“The men started arriving at nine, ten in the morning. It went on all day and night. I remember every client, every face...like in a nightmare.”

Brazilian woman trafficked to Surinam, then Germany, then the Netherlands
4x Virgin

“I was ten when she sold me. The men, they think if they have sex with virgin girl they get good luck. They will get sons. They will get money, get very rich. They pay very much money for sex with virgin girl, young virgin girl. So after first time, you get stitched up….two, three, four times.

I was four times virgin.”

– Cambodian girl trafficked within Cambodia.
Behind Closed Doors

“I cleaned, I polished, I washed, I cooked. I took care of their children. 24 hours a day....24/7. The lady of the house, she accused me of stealing. For any mistake, she beat me. They gave me only scraps to eat. I wasn’t allowed much of anything really. I wasn’t allowed to use the phone or go out. I was paid 50 cents a day. The Mister said he was sending the rest of my pay to my family. It was a lie. I was just their slave.”

— Indian woman trafficked to Dubai.
"The contract was worthless, but we didn’t know it until too late. The gatos tricked us because we were desperate for work. They took our documents. They promised us better conditions, better wages. Then they deducted every single item of food, housing, everything…. We even had to pay to use the toilet. It was impossible to get ahead of the debt. They used our ignorance against us."

— Brazilian landless laborer trafficked within Brazil.
Police Rescue

“Eleven months, locked in that apartment. I thought I was in hell. When the police burst in, I was so happy, so relieved. They arrested everybody. Then I was very scared. Scared from police. Scared from my pimp. Who can I trust?”

— Brazilian woman trafficked from Spain to Denmark.
Remittance

“It’s all about money. If I stop making the transfers, she will hire someone to harm my family.”

-- Nigerian woman trafficked to Italy
Somebody’s Brother
Son Father

Why do you care if older men are with younger women? Is it any of your business? In my opinion very few men are having sex with minors in Pattaya. Yeah, it happens, but they have different values, a different culture. The women are different here. They’re available.

How do I know she’s being forced?

-- Sex tourist in Thailand.
Survival Mask

“I put on a mask to survive, to do that work. Otherwise I would feel the pain and anger. I was an actress. I turned a knob. But underneath I was really depressed. You feel you’re dirty, you feel you’re raped. Now I’m learning how to forgive the people who hurt me. It took me years to remove that mask. Finally I found myself again.”

— Estonian woman trafficked to the Netherlands.
GLOBAL SCALE

UN’s International Labor Organization 2012 study
- **20.9 million** in forced labor/human trafficking
  - (3 in every 1000 people)
- 2.2 million (10%) state- or military- imposed prisons; by military or armed rebels (e.g., child soldiers)
- **18.7 million** (90%) in the private economy
  - 14.2m for **labor** and 4.5m **sexual exploitation** (3:1 ratio)
  - **Women/girls** 11.4m (55%) and **men/boys** 9.5m (45%)
  - **Adults** 15.4m and **children** 5.5m (3:1 ratio)


- Annual profits **$91.2 billion** in 2007 [Siddharth Kara]
- Problem rising in economic downturn [UNODC, Manpower Inc.]
HOT SPOTS GLOBALLY

- **South Asia**
  - 2/3 of the world’s victims
  - Disadvantaged “castes” in bonded labor
    - And also in child prostitution
    - Most never cross international borders

- **East Asia**
  - Large incidence for both sex & for labor

- **Persian Gulf**
  - Females & foreign workers (legal guest workers)

Sources:
- ~40% Latin America (not all through Mexico)
- ~40% East Asia (varying primary source nation in recent years)

For what purpose:
- Sex trafficking
- Labor
  - agricultural work
  - domestic servitude
  - even panhandling children -- forced begging in America
THE U.S.: NON-MIGRANT VICTIMS

- Human trafficking in the U.S.
  - Some not crossing borders
    - Chiefly prostituted minors
  - 293,000 runaways vulnerable to child sex trafficking victims.
  - At least 1 in 8, and up to 100,000 are victims
    [Source: National Center for Missing & Exploited Children, NCMEC]
  - 83% of sex trafficking victims (found) were U.S. citizens
    [Source: 2011 DoJ Report on TIP in the U.S.]
“3 Ps” derived from:


(which closely match)
THE 3 Ps

1. Prosecution of perpetrators
2. Protection of survivors
3. Prevention of trafficking beforehand

Which is the top imperative?
THE 3Ps

1. **Prosecution** of perpetrators
2. **Protection** of survivors
3. **Prevention** of trafficking beforehand
4 Ps

1. **Prosecution** of perpetrators
2. **Protection** of survivors
3. **Prevention** of trafficking beforehand
4. **Partnerships** of
   - Governments
   - Intergovernmental organizations (IGOs) (e.g., UN; International Organization for Migration)
   - Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs)
   - Businesses

...We’ll return to this
GLOBAL PROGRESS...ON PAPER

13 years after the
1. UN Palermo Protocol and
2. U.S. Trafficking Victims Protection Act...

- Over 3/4 of countries are parties to the UN’s Palermo Protocol

- Over 2/3 of countries have enacted laws prohibiting all forms of trafficking
Globally:

- **Number of prosecutions...**
  - 7,705 in 2012
    (Only 1153, or 15% in labor, up from 7% the previous year)

- **Victims found:** 41,210 in 2011
  (compare to 20.9 million total)

---

**Brazil in 2012**

Of an estimated 25,000 forced laborers...

- Rescued 2,560
- Only 286 prosecutions

- 39 received sentences – up a bit
- Many short sentences in halfway houses or commuted to community service,
- Some received up to 10 years (a first!)

[Source: 2012 U.S. Department of State TIP Report]
Humanitarian “T” Visas so migrant victims not deported

- If cooperate with law enforcement

Significant law enforcement efforts since 2000 TVPA for U.S. citizen victims

- Operation Cross Country of the FBI, State-level authorities, and NCMEC (latest round in August 2013 found 105 children from 76 communities)

- State Attorneys-General taking on craigslist.com and backpage.com
PROGRESS IN THE U.S.: THE BAD NEWS

- Limited shelter: Very few beds nationally for child sex trafficking victims. (Resort to detention.)
- Few international child trafficking victims found in U.S.
- Few children received services from DOJ under grants to serve child sex trafficking victims.
- 3 years ago, approximately 3 times as many prostituted kids arrested as protected and assisted
TRAUMA OF THE TRAFFICKED

Sources

Solutions
Many suffer traumas predating trafficking (e.g., domestic abuse before prostitution)
Recruiters and exploiters ("traffickers") subject victims to

- Psychological manipulation,
- Fraud, and/or
- Force

Rescindivism: return to a trafficker after being found
Impact on the Victim

- Trauma is cumulative
  - Often including high-volume sexual activity
  - Narcotics used by traffickers to control victims or by victims to self-medicate
EFFECTS OF TRAFFICKING

Betrayal trauma


Example:

1. Domestic abuse
2. Pimp/trafficker: grooming “loverboy” or “daddy”
3. Society treats victim as disposable or culpable
**EFFECTS OF TRAFFICKING**

- **Betrayal trauma**
- **Traumatic subordinate relationship**
EFFECTS OF TRAFFICKING

- Betrayal trauma
- Traumatic subordinate relationship
- “Stockholm Syndrome”
EFFECTS OF TRAFFICKING

- Betrayal trauma
- Traumatic subordinate relationship
- “Stockholm Syndrome”
- Complex trauma
- PTSD


EFFECTS OF TRAFFICKING

- Betrayal trauma
- Traumatic subordinate relationship
- “Stockholm Syndrome”
- Complex trauma
- PTSD

**Dissociative disorders**

TRAFFICKING TRAUMA COMPARED TO THAT OF...

Survivors of

- Internally displaced people and refugees
- Rape and other gender-based violence
- Domestic violence
- Betrayal by a loved one
- Prostitution
- Torture
- Hostage-taking

Overlaps?
Similarities? Differences?
SOCIETY’S REACTION

In prostitution, considered “foreign,” and/or undocumented, authorities and society treats survivors as

- knowing what they were getting into
- culpable
- criminal
- deportable
- disposable


- Afraid to come forward
- Don’t self-identify
- Compounds the trauma
PRESSURED EVEN WHEN FOUND

- Identified trafficking survivors are pressured to testify against perpetrators as a gateway to:
  1. Care and social services
  2. Regularized immigration status ("T Visa" in the U.S.)

Finding from 2007-2013 case analyses in Southeast Asia:
- Survivors in detention or shelters for long periods did not lead to more prosecutions, despite cost to freedom and access to other work
Mark P. Lagon and Anthony Clark Arend (eds.). (forthcoming 2014) Human dignity and the future of global institutions. Georgetown University Press,
SURVIVORS’ NEEDS

- **Shelter**

- **Physical health care**

Efforts and resources, *if any*, tend to focus on these
THEY ALSO NEED...

» Clinical care for complex trauma
THEY ALSO NEED, BUT AREN’T GETTING...

Clinical care for complex trauma

- Not provided due to lack of resources
  - Funding
  - Personnel
  - Training
ULTIMATE GOALS

- Economic viability to reclaim dignity
  - Soft and hard-skills training
  - Job placement assistance
- Reintegration into society
ULTIMATE GOALS STYMED

- Economic viability to reclaim dignity
  - Soft and hard-skills training
  - Job placement assistance

- Reintegration into society

Absent clinic care for trauma

Far harder to achieve
THE KEY TO THE PUZZLE

“Trust”
THE KEY TO THE PUZZLE

“Trust” -- to advance...

1. Survivors’ well-being
THE KEY TO THE PUZZLE

“Trust” -- to advance...

1. Survivors’ well-being
2. Broader systemic change
to reduce the incidence of trafficking
   (the Prevention “P”)
INTERVENTIONS...

Must prioritize building survivors’ trust

- To accept help
- Become employable and thrive
- Cooperate with law enforcement
INTERVENTIONS...

- Must prioritize building survivors’ trust
  - To accept help
  - Become employable and thrive
  - Cooperate with law enforcement
    - Prosecution of perpetrators *may* contribute to survivors’ reempowerment
    - But survivors must become stabilized before becoming willing and reliable witnesses
INTERVENTIONS...

- Must be tailored to account especially for
  - Betrayal trauma
INTERVENTIONS...

- Must be tailored to account for
  - Betrayal trauma
  - Law enforcement’s and society’s attitudes
    “blaming the victim”
    which **compound** traumatization
ANOTHER AREA TRUST IS NEEDED: PARTNERSHIPS

Trust between partners to offer survivors

- holistic help
- tangible agency and (re)empowerment
ANOTHER AREA TRUST IS NEEDED: PARTNERSHIPS

Trust between partners to offer survivors
  ▶ holistic help
  ▶ tangible agency and (re)empowerment

- Law enforcement
- Immigration officials
- Caregivers
- Nonprofits
- International agencies
- Even private sector actors
A CRUCIAL, UNEASY PARTNERSHIP

Law Enforcement

- Nonprofits
- Social services
- Caregivers
- Civil society
A NEW PARTNERSHIP:
BUSINESS AS PART OF THE SOLUTION

gbcat.org

- Carlson
- Coca Cola
- Delta
- Ford
- Hilton Hotels
- LexisNexis
- Manpower
- Microsoft
- NXP Semiconductor
- Travelport
ANTI-TRAFFICKING PARTNERSHIPS CAN BE...

- Transformative
  - Cook County, IL (Chicago)
    - DOJ Federally funded Task Force
    - State's Attorney Anita Alvarez
    - FBI
    - Local police
    - Local social services
    - Salvation Army

- Like cotton candy
TRUST’S 2 ROLES

TRUST

CLINICAL CARE

ROBUST PARTNERSHIPS
TRUST’S 2 ROLES

TRUST

CLINICAL CARE

ROBUST PARTNERSHIPS
THESE BOTH REQUIRE RESOURCES

CLINICAL CARE

ROBUST PARTNERSHIPS
CLINICAL CARE AND PARTNERSHIPS: DELIVERING FOR DIGNITY

DIGNITY

AGENCY

SOCIAL

RECOGNITION

CLINICAL CARE

ROBUST PARTNERSHIPS
Discussion